



**Governing Council  
of the  
United Nations  
Development Programme**

Distr.  
GENERAL

DP/1984/18  
14 March 1984

ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

Thirty-first session  
June 1984, Geneva  
Agenda item 4(d)

SUPPORT

PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION

EVALUATION

Report of the Administrator

S u m m a r y

This report responds to decision 83/12 of the Governing Council which requested "the Administrator to report on the progress made in strengthening evaluation work in the United Nations Development Programme and on the results of the evaluation work carried out to the Governing Council at its thirty-first session". The report, therefore, deals with the arrangements for the evaluation of the results and effectiveness of the Programme in the context of the Governing Council's expressed wish to be better informed about the results of programme activities.

The report specifically describes measures taken to improve evaluation policies and procedures. Summaries of the thematic evaluations are annexed. A separate report has been submitted to the Council on the joint UN/UNDP/UNIDO evaluation on manufactures industries. Approaches to strengthening the evaluation capacity of Governments are discussed. Finally, the results of a preliminary analysis of a sample of project evaluations are described. Further to this report, the attention of Council members is drawn to the reports of programme achievements by the regional directors for their respective regions.

## I. MEASURES TO IMPROVE EVALUATION

1. In decision 83/12, the Governing Council took note of the decision of the Administrator to establish a small Central Evaluation Office (CEO). This was accomplished on 1 October 1983 and the office was set up within the Bureau for Programme Policy and Evaluation initially with a professional staff of three. The mandate of the office is based on document DP/1983/ICW/6 which was submitted to the Governing Council after full consultation with the executing agencies. The CEO is responsible for:

(a) Developing and monitoring evaluation policies and procedures;

(b) Assisting in the transmitting of results of project and thematic evaluations to all levels of staff;

(c) Collaborating with executing agencies and the Joint Inspection Unit in developing a consistent, coherent and agreed upon set of evaluation practices;

(d) Reporting on the effectiveness of the Programme by means of periodic assessment of project and thematic evaluations and;

(e) Assisting the operational units in extending assistance to developing countries to enhance their capacity for evaluation.

2. CEO has initiated work on all of its responsibilities, in spite of the fact that, in terms of the workload that full implementation will entail, it is not yet fully staffed. The priority work programme of CEO for the first six months of its existence was first to review the entirety of UNDP's existing monitoring, reporting and evaluation policies, procedures and practices, and suitably revise them as needed to ensure that account had been taken of the elements necessary for a functioning evaluation system; and second, to examine carefully the Staff Report on Manufactures with a view to analyzing and reporting on the validity and practicality of the various conclusions and recommendations. The latter task necessarily led CEO, in collaboration with UNIDO, to the preliminary work on the Programme Advisory Note which was also requested by the Governing Council. During the remainder of 1984, in addition to the tasks mentioned above, CEO also intends to review appropriate samples of ongoing project evaluations (either in single projects or in clusters by sector, activity or region) to extract, to the extent possible, the degree of success in achieving the project objectives. Some new thematic evaluations will also be initiated during 1984. Other aspects of the work programme will include participation in the planning of training programmes on the design/evaluation linkage and provision of assistance and advice both within UNDP and to Governments seeking collaboration in enhancing their own evaluation capacities.

3. The re-examination of the entirety of UNDP's evaluation practices and policies (most of which were developed before 1974) to take account of subsequent developments is being undertaken jointly with the executing agencies using the informal Inter-Agency Working Group on Evaluation set up in accordance with the Administrator's proposal contained in document ICW/6. A first meeting of this Inter-Agency Working Group on Evaluation was held in the second week of January 1984. This meeting considered a first comprehensive draft paper describing the principles to be followed by UNDP, the agencies, and Governments in the practice of monitoring and evaluating for UNDP-assisted projects. The results of this frank and valuable exchange on the process of evaluation and the resulting division of labour, after analysis by UNDP, will be presented for further review at a second meeting in March 1984 in conjunction with the annual meeting of evaluators convoked by the Joint Inspection Unit.

4. The new policies and procedures guidelines will stress the need for objectivity and independence in evaluation and place even greater emphasis on the examination and objective measurement of results. They therefore seek to consolidate all activities including monitoring, evaluation, reporting and follow-up. They are seen as forming a spectrum of evaluation activities applicable to all the various projects and programmes UNDP supports. Managers are, therefore, encouraged to see the output of each one (whether monitoring, progress reporting, tripartite reviews or an independent evaluation) as an input to the next stage of an integrated system. They will be tested for a period of at least one year both at headquarters and in the field in order not only to enhance familiarity, but also to receive the benefit of advice from the users as to their practicality.

5. Internal evaluation activities, from monitoring to the conduct of tripartite reviews, will naturally be the responsibility of management; while independent evaluations will employ personnel not directly connected with appraisal, approval or implementation of the project. The various elements of the internal evaluation system, if properly performed, will, therefore, produce results of use both to management and to the independent evaluator. While most weight is given to operational questions, the new guidelines also address programme and thematic issues at all levels. The need for positive feedback to all relevant portions of the system is stressed.

6. The evolving system is based on the full recognition that maximum benefits can only be obtained when the system is effectively linked with the design and formulation of the project. Therefore, further needs for expanding ongoing training in these interrelated areas have been explored together with the executing agencies. It is intended to launch a training programme to develop a sufficient number of trainers both at headquarters and in the field, who in turn could deal with the wider requirements of the field offices in their regions.

7. As has been noted by the Governing Council, the work of the newly created CEO would in no way substitute for the existing monitoring and evaluation of project activities carried out under the responsibility of the regional bureaux and the special purpose funds. To link CEO effectively with the substantial volume of evaluation and monitoring of the ongoing projects and programmes, the concept of an "evaluation network" has been introduced involving designated officials at headquarters and in the field offices who act as evaluation co-ordinators for their operational units, and who will, in close collaboration with CEO, plan, manage and report on evaluation activities. Through the network, CEO will be kept informed of the results of evaluation in the field. Due to the enhanced impetus given to evaluation by the regional bureaux and other operational units at headquarters, there can be little doubt that performance in this regard will be greatly improved.

8. The third activity designed to improve evaluation activities in UNDP is that of active participation in the deliberations among the Joint Inspection Unit and the agencies, and feeding back the outcome of such working group meetings to evaluators and programme managers in UNDP. Apart from the continued day-to-day contact, these meetings in early 1984 (e.g. the Inter-Agency Working Group and one with JIU) are very beneficial to the process of formulating common policies and procedures.

## II. THEMATIC EVALUATIONS

9. UNDP has substantially completed work on the programme of thematic evaluations endorsed by the Governing Council in decision 80/22 and a status report is included in annex I to this report. The Governing Council endorsed a list containing 17 thematic evaluations (15 sector evaluations and 2 process studies). Only two evaluations, one on telecommunications training and the other on public administration, remain to be initiated. Both these evaluations have been incorporated in the new set of thematic evaluations for discussion with agencies to be presented for the consideration of the Governing Council. Initial discussions on this new list of thematic evaluations and process studies were launched in December 1983 and continued at the two meetings of the Inter-Agency Working Group on Evaluations.

10. To facilitate proper and timely implementation of thematic evaluations, a commonly applicable set of procedures has been agreed upon between UNDP and the executing agency or agencies. The procedures make it essential that the partners to the thematic evaluations concur on a number of basic issues, including joint definitions of the subject and the scope of the study, terms of reference, selection of countries and institutions, projects to be visited and personnel to be employed. Furthermore, a detailed schedule should be established for the timing and completion of these undertakings, and the partners to them should make arrangements for budgeting, cost sharing, assignment of personnel and provision of administrative support. These preliminary undertakings should avoid the difficulties which have been experienced in the past in organizing the financing of thematic evaluations, and in facilitating the smooth and efficient implementation of the programme.

/...

11. Any exercise to evaluate UNDP project experience jointly with a member Government and the specialized agencies should follow the model which was successfully tried out last year. It involved active support from the Federal Republic of Germany and WHO, and dealt with the thematic evaluation of human resource development for primary health care. A report on this study (DP/1983/16, annex) was considered at the thirtieth session of the Council. The administrative prerequisites mentioned in paragraph 10 above were all met for this study and this contributed to the smooth delivery of the desired product. The substantive and administrative controls which guide such thematic evaluations resemble those used in studies carried out with the executing agencies. It is important that such joint studies be on topics approved by the Governing Council and that the experts supplied by participating Governments should, for the duration of the study, be deemed to be in the employ of the United Nations.
12. The thematic evaluation dealing with national agricultural research institutes carried out in collaboration with the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), which commenced in 1981, has now been completed. A summary of the findings of the study is provided in annex II to the present report. The full report is being published by FAO.
13. The study on industrial training in collaboration with the International Labour Organisation (ILO) has also reached the completion stage. The review of the detailed studies and the results of the field missions were all completed in 1983. A summary of the findings of the study is provided in annex III to the present report. The full report is to be published early in 1984.
14. The study on manufactures industries was the subject of a note by the Administrator to the thirtieth session of the Governing Council.<sup>1/</sup> UNDP has responded to the requirements of Governing Council decision 83/12 which requested the Administrator to arrange for the full Staff Report to be translated into the working languages of the United Nations and distributed to Governments. It also requested the Administrator to examine further the conclusions and recommendations of the evaluation team and to determine those on which action could be taken, either immediately or after referral to the Governing Council, to improve project identification and implementation in the industrial sector.
15. In accordance with decision 83/12, the results of this further examination were communicated informally to members of the Governing Council prior to their being submitted to the Council at its organizational meeting in February 1984.<sup>2/</sup> The results, together with the views expressed during the organization meeting were also to be submitted to the April meeting of the Committee for Programme Co-ordination (CPC) for its consideration. The Administrator, in introducing this present report, will report orally to the Council on the outcome of the meeting of the CPC.

16. The Council also requested that "this work should result in the preparation of a Programme Advisory Note to provide guidance to programme staff of UNDP and UNIDO". The work on the Programme Advisory Note is underway. It will provide practical guidelines to programmers in the field establishments of UNIDO and UNDP, and also to Governments, in the formulation of industrial projects. The Programme Advisory Note will also refer to the other advisory notes issued for the industry sector so that links can be established among them.

### III. CENTRAL EVALUATION AUTHORITIES OF GOVERNMENTS

17. General Assembly resolution 38/171 'emphasizes the important role of the United Nations system in assisting developing countries, upon request, in developing their evaluation capacity, and requests the Secretary General, in consultation with the organs, organizations and bodies of the (United Nations) system to elaborate, in the light of the conclusions and recommendations of the Joint Inspection Unit..., (Operative paragraph 19) proposals to promote the evaluation capacity of recipient Governments'. The heightened concern of Governments with respect to evaluation, as reflected in this resolution, has also been evidenced in the conclusions and recommendations of many of the country mission reports prepared for the ongoing study on the changing requirements of developing countries for technical co-operation.

18. A number of Governments of developing countries have taken steps to strengthen their capability to employ evaluation more fully in the promotion of their development activities. UNDP has responded to several opportunities for the provision of technical co-operation to strengthen the evaluation capacity of Governments. The experience gained in responding to such requests will provide valuable help in stepping up UNDP's efforts in this regard, and in designing effective steps to enhance the evaluation capacity of developing countries. Apart from assistance rendered in strengthening of planning offices in many sectoral ministries, technical co-operation has also been provided to central planning authorities. This has focused principally in the development of a national capacity to identify, formulate and appraise projects. A review of some 20 such projects indicated that Governments were increasingly interested in strengthening their capacities to evaluate their own progress in implementing their development programmes or projects.

19. In addition to direct assistance to Governments for technical co-operation, UNDP is further ready to encourage and assist Governments to improve their own evaluation capabilities through maximizing the use of national and regional organizations for this purpose and through the sharing of monitoring and evaluation experience gained by both Governments and UNDP. The monitoring and evaluation of government-executed projects will also assist in developing practical and cost-effective guidelines in this area of evaluation.

/...

20. As an initial response to the renewed interest in evaluation by Governments, UNDP is updating the Directory of Central Evaluation Authorities. It is recognized that although this Directory will provide useful information, a list alone cannot fully illuminate the nature and scope of the participation of Governments in evaluating UNDP-assisted projects, as such participation is more often through the collaborating ministry than through whatever central evaluation mechanism may exist. The Directory will be updated periodically and expanded to include evaluation authorities other than those located centrally in Governments.

#### IV. RESULTS OF RECENT PROJECT EVALUATIONS

21. Evaluation results have in the recent past been presented to the Governing Council in the form of thematic evaluation summaries. Reports on individual project evaluations have, as a rule, not been sent to the Council, partly because this would require the explicit agreement in each case of the Government or Governments concerned; and partly because the information contained in the more than 150 evaluation reports each year would have to be systematized to provide an effective overview of the purposes, results and feedback of the evaluations conducted.

22. A study in mid-1983 was performed on the quality of some 50 evaluations (49 project evaluations and one country programme evaluation) carried out between July 1981 and June 1982. The overall purposes of this preliminary two-fold study were, first, to assess whether the operational conduct of the evaluations - from identification of the need for the evaluation, to the final follow-up of recommendations - followed consistent practices prescribed for UNDP evaluations. Second, it was hoped to identify any common substantive conclusions which could be drawn from the sample. The study, although modest in scope, revealed the need for greater systematisation in presenting purposes, processes and findings of the evaluations. However, it was found that over 75 per cent of the projects examined had competently designed terms of reference, and 60 per cent of the evaluations followed the terms of reference carefully. (It should, however, be remembered that frequently an evaluation may uncover issues not identified in the terms of reference, and that this is a valid and important function.) The recommendations that emerged from these evaluations were, in a preponderance of cases, found to be clear. Evaluation recommendations were successfully followed in 67 per cent of the projects. In the remainder, the evaluations led to significant management actions (such as phasing out or re-design of the projects) which, though not explicitly recommended by the evaluators, were prompted by their findings. Overall, such evaluations took between 2-3 weeks each, but it was often found that this time period was too short. The composition of the evaluation missions was divided equally, with independent consultants contributing 50 per cent; and the balance being made up of UNDP, agency and government officials. In conclusion, this limited study, which concentrated on the process and the quality of evaluations as such, allowing to draw

/...

lessons for the present review of evaluation guidelines, does not lend itself to judgments on the substance of the projects covered. While in the great majority of cases the evaluations were justified in terms of cost, information obtained, recommendations made and, above all, in terms of effects on project decision-making, such overviews will in the future have to encompass an analysis of project effectiveness as well.

23. It is, therefore, proposed in the future to attempt reviews of project evaluations in a specific sector or sub-sector covering a period of several years, in order to provide a larger sample from which common substantive conclusions can perhaps be drawn. The only country programme review included in the sample was conducted over a six-week period and used agency evaluations of the projects that constitute the Programme in its evaluation. It provided a useful overview and also a basis for project-level decision-making.

#### Notes

- 1/ DP/1984/L.13/Rev. 1
- 2/ DP/1984/1



Annex I

STATUS OF THEMATIC EVALUATIONS  
(March 1984)

| <u>No.</u>                          | <u>Title</u>  | <u>Collaborating agency(ies)</u>                | <u>Status</u>  |
|-------------------------------------|---|---|--|
| <u>Completed</u>                    |   |   |  |
| 1.                                  | Comprehensive Development Planning                                  | United Nations, World Bank                      | Published June 1979<br>Summary to GC 1978                              |
| 2.                                  | Rural Development: Issues and approaches for Technical Co-operation | (Many agencies consulted)                       | Published June 1979<br>Summary to GC 1978                              |
| 3.                                  | Rural Women's Participation in Development                          | (Many agencies consulted)                       | Published June 1978<br>Summary to GC 1978                              |
| 4.                                  | Agriculture Training  | FAO, ILO' UNESCO consulted                      | Published May 1980<br>Summary to GC 1980                               |
| 5.                                  | New and Renewable Sources of Energy                                 | (United Nations, World Bank) consulted          | Published May 1981<br>Summary to GC 1980                               |
| 6.                                  | Industrial Research and Service Institutes                          | UNIDO   | Dist. by UNIDO May 1980<br>Published August 1982<br>Summary to GC 1979 |
| 7.                                  | Educational Innovation and Reform                                   | UNESCO  | Summary to GC 1982<br>Published August 1983                            |
| 8.                                  | Trade Promotion: Building National Institution                      | International Trade Centre (ITC)                | Summary to GC 1981<br>Published November 1983                          |
| 9.                                  | Human Resource Development for Primary/ Health Care                 | WHO   | Summary to GC 1983<br>Published December 1983                          |
| 10.                                 | Textile Industry (not published by UNDP)                            | UNIDO   | Dist. by UNIDO Dec. 1978   |
| 11.                                 | Rural Co-operatives   | Committee for Promotion of Aid to Co-operatives | Summary to GC 1982<br>Under editorial review                           |
| 12.                                 | National Agricultural Research Institutions                         | FAO   | Being translated and printed by FAO                                    |
| 13.                                 | Manufactures Industries <sup>a/</sup>                               | United Nations, UNIDO                           | Informally discussed<br>GC 1983  |
| <u>Process Studies<sup>b/</sup></u> |   |   |  |
| 14.                                 | Government Execution  |   | See DP/558   |
| 15.                                 | Assessment of Efficiency in the Project Cycle                       |   | See DP/558   |
| <u>In progress</u>                  |   |   |  |
| 16.                                 | Industrial Training   | ILO (UNIDO/UNESCO consulted)                    | Final editing underway   |
| <u>To be undertaken</u>             |   |   |  |
| 17.                                 | Telecommunication Training Centres                                  | ITU   |  |
| 18.                                 | Public Administration   | United Nations                                  |  |

<sup>a/</sup> This study is an evaluation of UNDP-financed technical co-operation activities of UNIDO. It is not a thematic evaluation. However, it replaced the proposed thematic evaluation on light industries and it was funded by money originally allocated to that topic. This study was for the CPC which UNDP responded in 1984.

<sup>b/</sup> These two process studies have been overtaken by events since the twenty-seventh session of the Governing Council, details of which are reflected in DP/558, which deals, inter alia, with government execution and the project cycle.



## Annex II

### Summary of the UNDP/FAO thematic evaluation study on national agricultural research

#### I. BACKGROUND

1. Between 1970 and 1981, UNDP and FAO supported about 790 projects aimed at establishing or strengthening national agricultural research in developing countries. The total cost to UNDP was about \$757 million, representing approximately 16 per cent of UNDP's total assistance to agriculture<sup>1/</sup>. About 86 per cent of this amount was devoted to supporting national agricultural research institutions and the remaining 14 per cent to agricultural production projects with a research component.

2. In the face of persistent problems in food security and rural development, international agencies and Governments have been increasingly concerned about the effectiveness of agricultural research. Questions have been raised as to the applicability of research results in marginal conditions; in particular, whether too much emphasis had been given to the development of high input/high yield technology for cash crops produced under large-farm conditions, while subsistence crops in marginal and smallholder situations had possibly been neglected. Other questions were raised as to the diffusion of research results among the farmers, whether extension services and research institutions collaborated sufficiently to disseminate research findings to farmers and to feed back experiences from farmers to the research workers. Furthermore, it was felt that national agricultural research institutions were often inadequately supported financially. Other causes of concern included the planning of research, the determination of research priorities both by the Governments and by research-supporting external agencies and the extent to which national and international research interacted in developing better and more productive agricultural techniques.

3. Consequently, between 1981 and 1983, UNDP and FAO undertook an evaluation study of their programme of assistance to national agricultural research, with the principal objectives of critically reviewing experience and, on this basis, providing guidelines for future assistance in this field. It was felt all along that the experience of any given project was particular to that project. It was therefore decided not to focus on measuring the effectiveness of individual projects but rather on identifying issues which commonly influenced the success or otherwise of programmes supporting national agricultural research. The report of the study was submitted to the thirty-first session of the FAO Conference in November 1983, and is being published by FAO for wider circulation. The object of this paper is to summarize the results of the study and to highlight the main findings and conclusions.

## II. SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

4. The agricultural research activities covered by the study were defined as "all efforts to acquire new understanding of the technical and socio-economic aspects of agriculture through experimentation, trials and analysis of survey results and field studies, excluding, however, the actual collection and presentation of basic statistics (censuses, surveys, etc.)." The study did not cover the forestry and fisheries subsectors.

5. Twelve countries covering four main areas (Africa, Asia, Latin America and the Caribbean, and the Arab States) were selected and their Governments agreed to participate in the study. In these countries 75 agricultural research projects were studied, of which 42 had been completed. Desk studies of these projects were undertaken in 1981, and a comprehensive analysis of all UNDP/FAO supported agricultural research projects was completed early in 1982. Projects in the 12 countries were examined in the field in the first half of 1982. These studies were undertaken as follows: (a) six by national institutions and/or national consultants; (b) three by staff and consultants selected by FAO and UNDP in collaboration with national consultants; and (c) three by FAO staff in collaboration with national staff.

6. In addition to these country studies, 16 agricultural research projects in other countries, some of which had been the object of recent project evaluation missions, were reviewed. Thus a total of 91 projects were covered by the study, amounting to about 12 per cent of all national agricultural research projects implemented between 1970 and 1981.

## III. FINDINGS, MAIN CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

### A. National agricultural research policies and organization

7. The study has reinforced the widely held view that, although the achievement of applicable results from agricultural research is a lengthy and difficult process, carefully planned investment in adaptive research is an essential prerequisite for stimulating agricultural growth. While it is difficult to measure accurately the economic returns on investments in agricultural research, studies made in developing countries have clearly and consistently demonstrated very high returns. In relation to these potential benefits, there has been under-investment in agricultural research; in the majority of the countries studied, expenditures were less than 1 per cent of agricultural GDP and had not kept pace with growth in resources allocated to the agricultural sector.

8. The study found that greater attention to establishing research policies and to research management is needed in many countries, if investments in

research were to have the desired results and contribute to increasing agricultural production. The most effective management and co-ordination of research was achieved in countries where there was one stable organization responsible for agricultural research, under the aegis of the Ministry of Agriculture, which also had a measure of financial control. In some cases, parastatal research organizations provided a particularly favourable research environment, especially in projects with narrowly focused research objectives. In the absence of an effective central body, decisions on resource allocation tend to be guided less by priorities for increasing production and farm incomes than by pressures from competing institutions. This leads to dissipation and inappropriate allocation of resources as well as duplication of effort. The study also drew attention to the need to establish better career prospects for agricultural research scientists. Greater efforts are also recommended to incorporate the work of universities into national research programmes.

#### B. Research priorities and project selection

9. The study found that research programmes were most effective when based on coherent medium-term research plans which started from a detailed knowledge of both farming problems and socio-economic situations and priority objectives, including the identification of target beneficiaries. The study also found that, while commodity emphases in research programmes were broadly in line with their importance in the economy, the priorities were not clearly spelled out and, consequently, efforts tended to be dissipated. The study also found that certain key aspects of agricultural development tended to be neglected, although recent years have seen increasing attention paid to them. These aspects include the problems of small-scale farmers in marginal areas; some basic food crops, particularly roots and plantains; multiple cropping and inter-cropping; pre- and post-harvest losses; water use and irrigation; soil fertility; appropriate mechanization; socio-economic research; research documentation and research/extension liaison. To ensure that recommendations emanating from research are financially attractive to and compatible with the existing conditions and practices of the typical farmer, more attention needs to be paid, first, to on-farm verification of research-station results; and, second, to using the multidisciplinary farming systems approaches in the research programme.

#### C. Dissemination of research results

10. The study identified that a major and common problem is communicating research results to farmers in a form suitable for practical application and integration into the farming system. The report recommends that dissemination of research results to farmers should be improved. Among the measures suggested are the following: (a) that research institutions should organize

/...

short courses for extension agents by research institutions; (b) research results should be incorporated in extension packages which the extension agent can easily understand and which are periodically reviewed; and (c) research/extension liaison units should be established to draw up extension packages in close consultation between extension staff and scientists and monitor this application in practice in order to ensure the appropriateness of those recommendations for use by farmers.

#### D. Operational considerations for UNDP/FAO projects

11. While no attempt was made to categorize individual projects on the basis of their success or failure, the study found that, overall, UNDP/FAO assistance had made valuable contributions in assisting national agricultural research programmes. The 91 projects reviewed helped establish or strengthen 40 research institutions and most performed well in producing research outputs in diverse subjects (plant selection and breeding, agronomy, plant protection, etc.). At the same time the study identified a number of practical issues which require improvement in the design and implementation of projects in the future. They are as follows:

(a) While the design of projects usually defined adequately the ultimate objectives and activities of UNDP/FAO assisted projects, immediate objectives were often stated in rather general terms and were confused with activities. Moreover, they were not ranked in priority order. The study recommends that, in the implementation of UNDP/FAO agricultural research projects, an initial preparatory phase should be undertaken more frequently. Particular care should be paid to distinguishing between institution-building and production-support objectives, and to identifying target beneficiary groups;

(b) Technical backstopping of projects needs to be improved, particularly to ensure exchange of information, screening of project recommendations and the best use of fellowships and equipment;

(c) With respect to personnel inputs, experts working in a team were most effective while single experts could only be productive when there was an already well-established research programme. Short-term consultants could provide useful advice on particular problems, but visits of less than two to three months usually achieved little, since considerable time was needed for the consultant to acquire a basic understanding of the problems to be solved. In projects intended to build national research capacity rapidly, the use of junior experts and volunteers tended to detract from the active involvement of national staff;

(d) Fellowship training to build up national research manpower should aim at suitably high academic levels, equivalent to the Ph.D. and M.Sc. At

present, however, only less than half of the fellowships involve some form of academic training with only 2 per cent at the doctoral level;

(e) More care is needed in scheduling inputs so that the training of national staff, provision of buildings, delivery of equipment, and arrival of international expertise are logically timed;

(f) FAO/UNDP projects of at least 10 years' duration had the most significant impact in both establishing and strengthening national institutions and in delivering useful results. It should be recognized that both institution-building and technology development require sustained effort, with a longer time frame than the average UNDP project and country programme. Institution-building projects seldom gave sufficient emphasis to fellowship training, and this often had adverse consequences on the viability of the research institutions and sometimes led to continuing reliance on external expertise;

(g) Technical reports produced by projects frequently did not reach the national scientists for whom the results were important. The report recommends that these reports, which are often comprehensive and detailed, be attached as supplements to the terminal report, so that they are more readily retrieved and utilized;

(h) Opportunities for TCDC had been productive in several cases, and could be more effectively exploited, particularly among those countries with more advanced agricultural research capabilities and the least developed countries. Also, closer collaboration by national research organizations with the International Agricultural Research Centres of the Consultative Group for International Agricultural Research is recommended.

#### E. Project selection, monitoring and evaluation

12. The study concludes by pointing out the clear need for better dialogue and more thorough study by Governments, UNDP and FAO in the process of project selection, design, monitoring and evaluation. A prerequisite for better project selection is clearer enunciation of government policies and setting of research priorities; FAO/UNDP assistance is available for this purpose, but has seldom been utilized hitherto. More systematic provision should be made for stronger technical backstopping of projects and for review of project results during project implementation as well as for selective ex-post assessment of project effects and impact.

#### Notes

1/ Excluding projects in UNDP's global and interregional programme (36 projects, \$98.7 million), projects under FAO/Government co-operative (\$224.8 million) and FAO/TCP (\$8.8 million) programmes, and projects in the fisheries and forestry sectors.





### ANNEX III

#### Summary of the UNDP/ILO thematic evaluation study on training of industrial manpower

##### I. BACKGROUND

1. Competent manpower is one of the main foundations of development, perhaps the key element. Without adequately trained personnel at all levels and in all sectors of Government and of the economy, a country is not in a position to exploit its own national resources. The provision of the trained manpower needed for industry in any country is a complex process. It requires the establishment of comprehensive and flexible training policies and the identification of present and future needs in terms of both skills and numbers required within specified periods. It demands the design and implementation of programmes to meet those needs, including the setting up of appropriate physical facilities, provision and development of teaching staff, creation of specific standards and the evolution and application of appropriate and effective teaching methods and techniques.

2. UNDP has provided financial assistance to hundreds of projects in this field throughout the developing world. Many of these are in the area of industrial training, and most of these have been executed by ILO. In this field, ILO has been associated with UNDP and its precursors since the inception of the Expanded Programme for Technical Cooperation (EPTA). Figures for the total expenditure in this field before 1966 are not readily available, but between 1966 and 1983, ILO executed projects with a UNDP input of about \$380 million.

3. This evaluation was undertaken to assess the effectiveness of UNDP-assisted, ILO-executed programmes and projects in developing viable national training policies, programmes and institutions to train industrial manpower. It was carried out by means of a survey of projects in seven countries chosen to be representative of varying levels of development and industrialization. ILO's Governing Body had also requested an in-depth review of ILO's vocational training programmes,<sup>1/</sup> material from which has been used in this study.

## II. OBJECTIVES

4. The long-term objective of this study was to help improve the capability of UNDP and ILO to meet the needs of developing countries by improving the effectiveness and efficiency of technical co-operation in the field of industrial manpower.

5. The immediate objective was to attempt to evaluate the contribution made by government projects assisted by UNDP and ILO, in selected countries, to the development and strengthening of training policies and programmes, so as to identify the factors influencing their success or failure. It aimed to do so in national terms rather than in terms of the performance of individual facilities of schools, curricula and training methods.

## III. SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

6. The study was limited to manpower in manufacturing, building and construction, power generation and distribution and surface transport. The categories of manpower covered were semi-skilled and skilled workers, supervisors, technicians and managers directly employed in these sub-sectors. The technical and scientific education of engineers and scientific personnel, whether initial or advanced, was not covered.

7. The type of training covered included initial training, further and advanced training or retraining for updating, upgrading or promotion through vocational, technical or management training programmes. It covered training in institutions, within enterprises and any combination of training on or off the job, including apprenticeship. It did not include formal education within the school or university system.

8. Since both time and resources were limited, studies were concentrated on the following areas:

(a) The context in which national training policies are formulated, their nature and the machinery for implementing and controlling them;

(b) The design and operation of training schemes, institutionalized or not, at national or sectoral levels;

(c) The lessons to be learned from this analysis which can be applied to future assistance in this field.

9. The study was initiated in 1980, and carried out by means of desk surveys and missions, together with material from the ILO In-depth Review of Vocational Training. The findings regarding individual countries were consolidated in country reports. The findings from the complete survey have been consolidated and synthesized in a final report. It is expected to be published early in 1984. Meanwhile, the main conclusions and recommendations are summarized below.

#### IV. FINDINGS, MAIN CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

10. Before examining the findings and conclusions of the study a note of caution is necessary. While it is possible to assess the efficiency of such elements as implementation schedules, recruitment of national and international personnel, delivery of equipment or provision of other facilities by the Government and UNDP/ILO, it is not equally easy to measure objectively the quality and effectiveness with which knowledge is transferred through international co-operation. Furthermore, it must be borne in mind that in general the total UNDP/ILO input is only a small part of the total resources put into the training field by Governments themselves and that in many cases assistance is also being provided by some other development agencies. Therefore, although in what follows an effort has been made primarily to assess the results of UNDP/ILO co-operation with Governments, some of the conclusions by necessity have been drawn from the results of a wider endeavor.

11. This above being said, the fact is that an immense amount of work was done in the 57 projects which are the subject of this evaluation. The Report stresses that hundreds of national staff, hundreds of instructors, tens of thousands of skilled workers and managerial staff were trained directly while the projects were still operational. In addition, in every country studied, ILO provided assistance in one or more of the various fields associated with the planning and administration of training, as well as the legislation necessary to implement those measures and activities and to create the training institutions themselves. While the effectiveness of individual projects varied, none can be said to have entirely failed in these respects.

12. Of the 22 institutions in the vocational and technical training, management development, and productivity and small enterprise service fields with which UNDP/ILO has been or is directly associated, only three seem to have disappeared. Two of these were discontinued when they had successfully served their immediate purposes in the light of economic needs as seen by the Government at the time. Neither the training provided nor the equipment were lost.

13. Of the remaining institutions, seven have increased their output in terms of numbers trained. It is more difficult to judge to what extent they may have continued to develop qualitatively and in terms of increasing their range of teaching programmes. Most of these organisations, especially those in management, have had substantial further aid from other sources. Of the remaining 12, conditions vary from "holding the fort" in terms of maintaining standards and output but with no sign of further development, to just surviving. The fact that most institutions assisted by UNDP/ILO projects, some of them launched nearly 20 years ago, are still in existence is in itself quite a remarkable achievement.

##### A. Findings on past programmes and projects

14. UNDP/ILO projects in the industrial training field fall into four main groups:

(a) Participation in setting up machinery for the assessment of training needs and for the administration of vocational education and training.

/...

- (b) Participation in setting up or strengthening vocational training systems, institutions and centres;
- (c) Participation in setting up or strengthening management development and productivity institutes or centres;
- (d) Participation in setting up or strengthening facilities for servicing and training entrepreneurs and personnel of small-scale enterprises and artisans.

15. Overall the study examined the policy-making and planning mechanisms and the administrative structures relating to industrial training in the countries visited. In none of them did the training system conform to any "model" system or structure. None was complete in every function, and each country exhibited different strengths and faced different problems. In spite of problems and shortcomings, the systems all worked with a measure of efficiency and much effective training was being done. The great majority of the institutions examined are currently operating with reasonable effectiveness nearly 20 years after UNDP/ILO assistance was initiated, and are turning out a very large number of trained and upgraded personnel able to contribute their skills to industry. Most of those examined are now operating with little or no external assistance.

16. It is important to consider training as a system. In the past, however, training projects had generally been developed individually in the first place. As a result, successor projects complementing the initial one become necessary. It is noteworthy that in all but one of the countries studied, training projects had been launched before effective national machinery for manpower planning had been established, although in the 1950s and early 1960s a manpower planning specialist was generally included in the ILO teams sent out to identify needs and prepare projects.

17. With regard to management development institutes, the success of these projects depended very much on the extent to which they were able to attract the interest of the industries to take part in and contribute to their activities; as a result their effectiveness has varied widely from case to case. It was noted that in four of the seven countries studied, the capability for management development set up through UNDP/ILO assistance did not form a part of a ministry or of the formal training system, the latter being limited to worker and, sometimes, supervisor training.

18. The last and, in terms of expenditure, the smallest of the training programmes was that directed at improving the performance of small enterprises. Since these were generally concerned with upgrading performance in existing firms, even where they formed part of ministries, they operated outside the formal training system. In fact, projects designed to assist small enterprises through training and consultancy are rarely fully effective, except in a few cases where the services are confined to a single sector. This is, in fact, the area which in the future will require the greatest attention both in the technical and managerial training fields.

19. The training activities of UNDP/ILO in management development programmes and to a lesser extent in small enterprises have diminished considerably in recent years and it seems unlikely that they will ever regain their previous

/...

importance. This is partly due to the fact that institutions were set up in many countries at a time when ILO had a large programme in this field, most of which are still operating with greater or less efficiency and there is therefore no real need to establish further institutions. There is, however, certainly a continuing need for upgrading of staff and the introduction of up-to-date programmes, which need to be substantially different in nature and means of action if the institutions concerned are to remain viable. The other reason for the decline is that there are now many consultants specializing in management training as well as a large number of university schools of business both in the United States and in Europe with competent faculties whose members are readily available for overseas assignments.

20. All the countries examined now have vocational training facilities, for the most part set up with UNDP/ILO co-operation, although these do not necessarily form wholly integrated systems in which these facilities can be made fully responsive to changing needs. While the facilities for the most part are able to provide adequate training in basic industrial skills, little has been done as yet to meet the challenges of the new technologies either in the vocational training or management training fields. Nor do the conclusions of studies on the impact of these new technologies yet seem to have been influential in the design of programmes and projects.

B. Issues and trends in future UNDP/ILO technical assistance in industrial training

21. Over the past few years the nature and conditions of operation of UNDP/ILO training programmes have changed in a number of ways. Basic institutions in both the vocational and management training fields have been established in most countries with assistance from United Nations or other agencies, but a vast need for training remains to bring the facilities to levels comparable with those in the industrialized countries both in quantity and quality. This need springs from:

(a) Changes in nature and emphasis in the course of industrial development, for example, moving from the less sophisticated basic industries to those with more complex technologies and organizations, as well as the development of industrial employment in rural areas;

(b) The accelerated development of new technologies, especially in the fields of control and information;

(c) The need to make established training facilities more efficient and more effectively responsive to the demands and behavior of national employment markets.

(d) Changes in the availability and sources of technical co-operation funding.

22. The evaluation study has identified the following as the issues which would set the trends and patterns of further UNDP/ILO technical assistance programmes and projects in the fields of industrial training, and makes recommendations accordingly.

## 1. Policy issues and recommendations

### (a) Formulation of national training policy

23. The development of comprehensive training policies is a continuing process whose features include flexibility in the face of changing needs and environmental conditions, which requires adequate information embodying all the many factors which have to be taken into account. In most of the countries studied, manpower statistics, manpower assessment and forecasting, and economic forecasting in general were still weak and the manpower planning units, under whatever title, tended to be merely information gatherers and disseminators and had little power to influence events. Without more complete information and without a central body which has the power to impose its decisions on the training system (for example, in the matter of sectoral training schools within individual ministries), there will continue to be overlapping and dispersal of resources.

24. Governments should examine carefully the real state of their manpower and training policy and planning mechanisms with a view to ensuring that these are operating effectively and that the information on which policies are based is truly comprehensive. Future UNDP/ILO assistance in the field of training policy and administration should emphasize the element of flexibility in both planning and implementation so as to be able to cope with the different situations of the developing countries. Provision should also be made to assist and advise employers' and workers' organizations.

### (b) Migration and national training policies

25. In two of the countries visited there was very heavy migration of skilled manpower to better remunerated jobs abroad. This phenomenon is not uncommon, and can increase the demand on national training institutions and prolong the period for which they require external assistance. In addition, the loss of trained manpower may impede the development of national industries. Some of the problems created might be considerably reduced by the development of regional or bilateral manpower agreements involving both labour exporting and labour receiving countries.

26. UNDP and ILO could provide assistance in the study and formulation of such policies and more specifically provide technical co-operation to create and strengthen regional capabilities for training guidance and placement, as well as with research and policy development activities. A crucial problem to be examined is whether scarce funds should be used to support the training of labour going abroad when there are still heavy demands for manpower training for national industries.

### (c) Financing of training

27. The financing of training on a national scale is a serious concern for many Governments. Several countries visited had established levy-grant systems of financing, although using it in different ways. Although the systems can be shown to have given considerable impetus to training activities, in practice they often tend to benefit large and medium size enterprises to the virtual exclusion of small firms and those in the informal

/...

sector. Nevertheless, the participation of employers in the cost of training invariably leads to their greater involvement in the development of training policies and programmes.

28. The national training programmes should be designed to encourage the participation of employers in financing.

(d) Training and the informal sector

29. The training system in most countries virtually bypasses the informal sector and most attempts to provide training for it have not proved successful. Small enterprises and artisans in the "informal sector" contribute substantially to the economies in many countries. In view of the limited growth of employment opportunities in large and medium size industry, more attention will have to be paid to small and artisan industries in the future. Directly related to training for the informal sector is the training of young people dropping out of education at primary or low secondary levels. The majority of vocational training projects examined are designed more to deal with the demand than the supply of manpower. Since modern opportunities are much fewer in the modern sectors of industry, one hope for alleviation of the unemployment of young people appears to be in the small-scale, artisan, and informal sectors for which special training would be necessary. In certain countries visited, the provision of some general elementary industrial skills is shown to have improved the chances of employment by such young people, many of whom have been absorbed in very small firms.

30. The training, infrastructures, programmes and methodologies must be increasingly geared to skill development for the informal sector thus providing possibilities of increased youth employment. Innovative approaches are needed when designing suitable programmes and projects.

(e) Access and integration of women into vocational training

31. In many countries women do not have access to training in the skills needed to participate effectively in modern industry. In none of the countries visited in the study was any substantive training project encountered aimed specifically at training women for modern industry, although in at least two, girls were able to participate in training schools on the same basis as boys. Out of some 30 projects examined in the recent ILO - in-Depth Review of Vocational Training, only five related specifically to women and only one of these was directed to the modern sector. Although for some years ILO has been promoting industrial employment and training for women, for which they have shown themselves perfectly adapted, the resources devoted have been very small.

32. It will be necessary for Governments, UNDP and the ILO to concentrate much more resources on policies and projects promoting the training of women.

(f) Youth training

33. The question of training young people for industry has already been touched upon in connection with training for the informal sector. With high

birth rates in most developing countries, the numbers of young people coming on to the labour market are ever-increasing. The most disadvantaged are those at the bottom of the educational scale. Indeed, in many countries there is serious over-production at the upper end of the educational scale in relation to current employment opportunities. Most Governments are now concerned with providing the educationally disadvantaged with some basic skills so that they will be more easily employable by industry or at least undertake some gainful activity but so far they seem only to have scratched the surface of the problem. Given the near certainty that there will be no possibility of providing employment in modern industry for more than a small fraction of this population, more should be done to see whether these young people cannot be given a rapid training in a range of skills which can be useful to them in their everyday lives and which would be valuable in rural areas where many services to be found in the cities are lacking.

34. It would now be opportune to examine what has been done in this field, how effective it has proved to be and what steps can be taken to make it more effective. UNDP and ILO should join with other organizations concerned with this problem to institute such an enquiry.

(g) Information on training resources

35. Lack of or inadequate access to information on training by policy- and decision-makers was singled out in several countries studied as a serious obstacle to the development of national training systems, hampering their effectiveness. There is great need for better data and access to it by training authorities which might facilitate the development of new programmes and methods at relatively low cost without recourse to external aid.

36. Better facilities for the dissemination of information is an important area for UNDP/ILO co-operation at country, regional or interregional levels.

2. Operational issues and recommendations

(a) Long-range planning of technical co-operation in training

37. Training industrial manpower is a long-term activity which can rarely, if ever, be accomplished successfully by the establishment of institutions with the aid of a single project of a few years duration. However, aid in the past has tended to evolve from project to project as the shortfalls from one project pointed to the need for a successor, rather than being planned on a long term basis. The study found that in practice, country programming seemed to have resulted in a relatively short-term planning horizon for UNDP/ILO support of training programmes and institutions.

38. The question of how the country programming system can be more adequately used than in the past to develop medium and long range development objectives in the training field, should be carefully examined by UNDP and the ILO.



(b) Fluctuations in UNDP finances

39. The cutbacks in programmes caused by the 1975-1976 financial crisis in UNDP are mentioned in practically every terminal report of the projects which were the subject of this study. All stress its negative effects on project design and implementation.

40. To ensure the effectiveness of programmes and projects it is essential for UNDP to be able to maintain a steady level of operation and to plan in the medium terms, if not the long term.

(c) Interagency co-ordination

41. The field of training is assisted by many agencies, multilateral and bilateral. Evidence was found in the course of the study of some problems of lack of coherent action by agencies in different but related projects. There appears to be a need for more effective co-ordination between development assistance agencies.

42. The UNDP resident representative is the logical focal point to assist Governments in this, and should be provided with greater support in this respect.

(d) Technical co-operation among developing countries (TCDC)

43. Several of the countries visited were involved in TCDC activities in the training field. Officials emphasized that this form of co-operation enabled them to make substantial economies of scale in the solutions of common problems, for example in performing work for which there were strong common needs and goals as in developing training materials, designing skills standards and certification or for the purpose of exchanging information on means of training, financing, and legislation. UNDP financial support to date had proved very effective.

44. UNDP and ILO should continue to be alert to every opportunity to promote TCDC in industrial training, and to provide financial support wherever possible.

(e) Design and scheduling of technical co-operation projects

45. The single greatest problem encountered in every country and in a majority of projects, especially in the establishment of institutions, was poor project design. As a result, it was often found that the various inputs needed were not available with the others at the time required. In the second place, more stringent monitoring of execution is necessary. On the part of ILO, these failures were due to delays in the arrival of international staff and the delivery of equipment, sometimes as much as two years late. On the Government side the problems were in the late completion of buildings and the late appointment of suitable national technical staff required so that they could be trained. In many cases this made it impossible to implement the training programmes foreseen within the period the project was scheduled to be operational. In several cases this necessitated an extension to the project; in a few cases a successor project was necessary. The cost of these delays is

/...

two-fold. First, additional international and national funds are required to finance extensions or the parts of successor projects needed to overcome shortfalls. Second, the country is deprived of the trained manpower that would have been produced had the project run on time.

46. Most of these delays could be eliminated or much reduced by greater use of preparatory assistance. Financial provision should be made for participation in the preparatory missions of procurement and other specialists who could examine equipment and building needs on the spot in association with national staff concerned, leading to better and more realistic project design.

(f) Follow-up after completion of the project

47. A feature lacking in all the projects examined was the provision in the project document for some follow-up after the project terminated. Several national officials pointed out the desirability of short visits from consultants during the first year or two after the end of a project to monitor progress and provide guidance.

48. Project documents should include provision for periodic follow-up missions as appropriate.

(g) Training of trainers

49. Although the large-scale training of trainers has so far usually been included in the technical co-operation projects for institution building, it is often dealt with from a short term perspective, while a medium-to long-term development process is required. The problem is serious and it demands heavy investments.

50. UNDP and ILO should become increasingly involved in the preparation and implementation of long-term national schemes to train instructors and other training personnel.