



Strengthening of National Capacities for National Development Strategies and Their Management: An Evaluation of UNDP's Contribution

Country Study - Togo

By Cheikh Faye

Evaluation Office, July 2010
United Nations Development Programme

CONTENTS

Acronyms	3
1. Introduction	4
2. Context	4
3. National Development Strategies	6
4. UNDP Contribution to the Development of Strategic Capabilities	10
4.1 UNDP's Contribution	
4.2 Support to the Development of Strategic Capabilities in UNDP Programming Tools	
4.3 Alignment with Main principles of Capacity Development	
5. UNDP Capacity to meet the needs	15
6. Conclusions and Lessons Learned	16
Appendices:	
1. Persons Consulted	
2. Documents Consulted	

Acronyms

AfDB	African Development Bank
AIDS	Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome
CENET	National Centre for Information Technology Research
CPAP	Country Programme Action Plan
CPD	Country Programme Document
CRN	Re-engagement Framework Document
CWIQ	Survey of Basic Indicators of Well-being.
ECOWAS	Economic Community of West Africans States
EC	European Community
EMUWA	Economic and Monetary Union of West Africa
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
HIPC	Highly Indebted Poor Countries
HIV	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
IMF	International Monetary Fund
MDGs	Milennium Development Goals
NGOs	Non Government Organisations
ODA	Official Development Assistance
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
PAP	Priority Action Plan
PIP	Public Investment Programme

1. Introduction

1. This case study on Togo is part of an evaluation of UNDP's contribution to capacity development in national development strategy formulation and implementation internationally.¹ The evaluation focuses on capacity at central government levels to formulate policies and strategies and implement them effectively and efficiently.

2. The work was carried out on the field during two visits to Lome: the first in late May and the second in the second and third weeks of June 2010. The study has been conducted on the basis of an analysis of secondary data collected from the UNDP and national authorities in Togo. This documentation review was supplemented by interviews with resource persons in UNDP, government administration and civil society organizations. Government respondents included those from organisations responsible for central strategic planning: the Presidency of the Republic, the Prime Minister's Office, the Ministry of Community Development and Planning, the Ministry of Economy and Finance and the Ministry responsible for the Civil Service. Two federations of NGOs, who participated in the formulation of the PRSP were also interviewed, as were development partners present in Togo. A list of interviewees and their institutions is attached to the main evaluation report. The consultant and national representatives conducted a workshop for a self-assessment of capabilities and experience in the field of national development strategies, and UNDP's contribution in this regard.

4. The mission received excellent cooperation from the UNDP Country Office and Government authorities, in particular the Directorate General for Development and Planning (the main focal point of UNDP). However, the fact that the mission fieldwork took place in a period of transition between administrations made meetings with government officials difficult to arrange. The report is prepared in accordance with the terms of reference

2. Context

5. Togo is a country in West Africa bordered to the north by Burkina Faso, to the east by Benin and to the west by Ghana. It covers an area of 56,600 square kilometres and has a population estimated at 5.6 million (a density of 98 inhabitants per square kilometre). The rate of natural increase is 2.4% with 63% of the population living in rural areas, and nearly 44% comprising young people.

6. Togo gained independence April 27, 1960. Most other states in West Africa region gained Independence during this period. On September 27, 1992, a new Constitution was promulgated which has since been amended, including its contents on the renewal of presidential terms. The Basic Law confers the highest office on a President of the Republic, who is elected by universal suffrage, through a single-ballot mechanism, and where there is no limit on the number of terms that may be served. The post of Prime Minister is Head of Government, appointed by the President, but chosen from the Party with a parliamentary majority. The unicameral Parliament is elected by direct universal suffrage: a legislature also lasts five years. The country is divided into five administrative regions: Maritime, Plateaux, Central, Kara and Savanna.

¹ The other case study countries included Botswana, Paraguay and Saudi Arabia.

7. The 1992 Constitution was part of major political change that was part of a process of democratic openness in the country. A National Conference held from July 8 to August 28, 1991 had allowed national players to initiate a democratic process that would eventually grow contentious, and sometimes violent. However, the situation worsened in the 1990s; the country was isolated from networks of international cooperation and most of the aid flows they generate.

8. In 2005 the country held its first multiparty presidential election whose result was disputed by the opposition and resulted in significant unrest. At the end of this five-year term, the second multiparty election was held in March 2010. While the opposition criticized the fairness of the vote, international observers noted irregularities but which did not compromise the fairness of the vote won by the outgoing President. After the election, while there were demonstrations by opposition protesters, the situation was much calmer than in 2005. A broad-based government was established in June 2010, involving representatives from some opposition parties.

9. The Togolese economy is still heavily dominated by agriculture which forms 40% of gross domestic product. Services are growing in importance however, now representing 35% of GDP. The informal economy reached significant size, covering about 72% of GDP in the agricultural sector. Between 1991 and 2009, the country had an average real economic growth rate of 1.4% per annum, with a slight improvement since 2006 with an annual rate of 2.6%. The sectors contributing most in terms of value added are also the major brakes on the economy in that they contribute little to the overall growth rate: 0.2% for agriculture and 0.3% for services. With 0.5% as its rate of growth, the secondary sector demonstrates some dynamism, compared to the above sectors.

10. In recent years, Togo has experienced severe restrictions in development cooperation following the political and social crisis. Development assistance has fallen from 11.9% of GDP in 1990 to 2.5% in 2003. This situation had major impact on public investment in the period. The crisis of public finances up to 2005, exacerbated by the absence of financial support from the Bretton Woods Institutions, has caused an explosion of debt. The level was nearly 95% of GDP in late 2007. Debt relief obtained in 2008 after the signing of the Poverty Reduction and Growth Facility, however, reduced the ratio to 75% of GDP at the end of 2008.

11. The country has a very high incidence of poverty, estimated at nearly 62% according to surveys conducted in 2006. Poverty is particularly prevalent in rural areas where it affects 74.3% of the population, against 36.7% in urban areas. There are other disparities in the distribution of poverty. It affects 64.2% of households headed by men against 50% of households headed by women. The situation is even more varied geographically, with a 24.5% poverty rate in Lome (the lowest proportion in Togo) and a maximum of 90.5% in the Savannah region.

12. The 2009 Global Human Development Report, published by UNDP, ranks countries in terms of their human development index, puts Togo in 159th place worldwide with an index of Human Development of 0.499. Compared with the 2006 situation where Togo was ranked

147th out of 177 countries surveyed, there was a significant deterioration in its profile: the country has lost 12 places in just three years.

13. The 2009 report finds that resources devoted to the MDGs, including through the PRSP, are far below expectations. The funding represents only 44% of needs (MDG Progress Report, April 2010). The 2009-2011 PRSP claims that progress will be made mainly in access to basic education and the fight against the AIDS pandemic. On the other MDGs, the diagnosis indicates that the country can make significant advances.

14. The United Nations Development Programme is an important cooperation partner of the Republic of Togo. The agency was one of the few remaining partners in the country during the period of suspension of cooperation (1992-2005) and has assisted national authorities in preparing for the return of the international community. UNDP facilitated the process of appeasement that culminated in open elections in 2005 and assisted the country in the development and implementation of the 'roadmap' that allowed it to reconnect with its main funders, including the Bretton Woods Institutions and the European Union.

15. UNDP is currently developing its cooperation with Togo in the framework of a programming cycle whose instruments are:

- UN Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) 2008-2012
- Country Programme Document (CPD), 2008 -2012
- Country Priority Action Plan (PAP), 2008 -2012

3. National Development Strategies

16. Togo has a Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper which is the current focus of development policy and the key to mobilization of financial and technical support from the international community. The idea of formulating a PRSP arose in the early 2000s, the period when this planning tool entered the arsenals of programming in the sub-region. However, disruptions caused by the financial crisis led to delays in its finalisation. The country only prepared a first draft of this document in 2008 (the 'Interim' PRSP). The full PRSP was finalized and adopted in June 2009, and covers the period 2009-2011.

17. A Priority Action Programme for the same period complements the PRSP. The PRSP is based on an extensive diagnosis of the development situation and major constraints, and defines strategies for growth and human development in the context of the fight against poverty. These strategies are organized around four main pillars:

- i. Political, institutional and economic
- ii. Construction of foundations for sustainable growth and shared well
- iii. Human Development
- iv. Grass-roots development and Reducing regional disparities

18. The PRSP came after the National Strategy for attaining the MDGs (2006-2015). The PRSP supports the Millennium Development Goals, at least in terms of its analysis and diagnosis. However, regarding implementation strategies, the document is vague. As stated above, it is stated that the only MDGs which, through continued efforts, Togo has a chance to attain in 2015 are those related to universal primary education and the fight against HIV. The other six will not be attained by 2015 unless there are more favourable circumstances in terms of increased flows of international aid.

19. An institutional framework to implement the PRSP has been set up. The main elements are:

- National Council of Policy Development and Fight against Poverty
- Inter-ministerial Committee responsible for Strategies to Fight against Poverty
- Technical Steering Committee of the Strategy for Poverty Reduction
- Permanent Technical Secretariat of the PRSP (the only permanent functional institution)
- Sectoral PRSP Committees
- Regional Committees Participatory Monitoring
- Local Participatory Monitoring Committees
- State Committee / Donors

20. The formulation of the PRSP was accompanied by a number of studies, financed by donors, including UNDP. The most significant related to:

(i) "Long-term strategy focused on the MDGs"

(ii) "Sources of growth and business environment in Togo"

(iii) "Review of action against poverty in Togo"

(iv) "Assessment of Public Finance" and

(v) "Contribution of civil society organizations to reduction of poverty in Togo." Statistical data on poverty came mainly from a household survey conducted in 2006.

21. The budget framework is 985 billion CFA francs, needed for implementation of the PRSP over three years. The financial package reveals a shortfall of 7.4%. The estimated resources available (912 billion, representing 92.6% of total) are made up of 78% internal resources and 22% external resources.

22. The formulation process included intensive consultations, based on various drafts. The main actors in this process were (i) central government agencies (ii) local government (iii) the private sector, (iv) civil society, (v) technical assistance and development co-operation partners, (vi) the general public. Parliamentarians were also invited to the final validation workshop.

23. As a first step, a roadmap and an outline of content was shared within government, with donors, the private sector and civil society. Terms of reference were then finalised and validated at a national workshop, which also served as the launch event. The text was

prepared through expert studies. Consultations with sector groups involved the above-mentioned players.

24. Inputs were consolidated into a summary document a draft of which was widely circulated. A national workshop was convened. The PRSP was adopted by Government in June 2009.

25. While the PRSP is the main strategic development document in Togo, other planning tools are also used, some of which remain from earlier days; others are more recent in origin. Togo prepared a twenty year Development Plan covering the period 1966-1987. This long-term framework was accompanied by medium-term five-year development plans. These prevailed until 1982, when the last Five Year Plan was suspended.

26. This change in planning practice was associated with the onset of structural adjustment, which needed shorter-term programming tools and management. Under Structural Adjustment Programmes, five-year plans were replaced by Three-Year Rolling Public Investment Program.

27. Today, Three-Year Investment Programmes are still formulated, despite the existence of the Priority Action Plan of the PRSP. The PAP takes into account the macroeconomic situation in which the state finds itself with its financial partners. The PIP does not, and depicts state ambitions in terms of investment.

28. Finally, there is a Medium Term Expenditure Framework. This exercise has started with support from development partners such as UNDP and AfDB at central government level and will be rolled out gradually to sectoral ministries.

29. The actors who lead these planning tools are the Ministry of Economy and Finance, and the Ministry of Planning and Development. The Monitoring Unit for implementation of PRSP is currently under the Ministry of Economics and Finance. It works to the Directorate General for Development within the Ministry itself, and with the sectoral ministries.

30. The Priority Action Plan of the PRSP and the Rolling Public Investment Program are both formulated by the Ministry of Development Planning in conjunction with sectoral ministries, and collates expressions of needs.

31. In terms of coordination, the two ministries mentioned above are involved. They also mediate between the various proposals from the technical ministries. The Prime Minister as head of government would be expected to give strategic direction, but this has not happened until recently, due to institutional weaknesses. These relate to the origins of the office of Prime Minister in Togo. It was created following the national conference in 1992, as a concession to one of the opposition factions. Forced to share power, the Presidency of the Republic, the traditional centre of power, was reluctant to let the Office of Prime Minister really gain institutional capacity.

32. It was only recently that coordination, direction and arbitration functions of the Prime Minister began to emerge. Terms of reference were developed for key ministries, from

2006. Today, this practice extends to all departments, and provides systematic ‘roadmaps’ against which responsible officials are evaluated. UNDP supports capacity development of coordination and steering functions of the Prime Minister’s Office, through an international expert in governance and administration.

33. The Presidency is also developing strategic capabilities, and is getting to grips with the technical issues of development. Hitherto, these issues were politicised. There is also an international expert working as the President's Special Adviser for Planning, Coordination and Monitoring and Evaluation. Recently, with the definition of the new cabinet, the Ministry of Planning and Development has been attached to the President of the Republic, indicating the importance that the current Head of State attaches to these issues.

34. Official Development Assistance (ODA) in Togo is estimated by the OECD at USD 121 million in 2007 almost equally divided between bilateral sources (52%) and multilateral sources (48%). ODA was only 79 million USD in 2006. The significant increase is partly explained by the external support to the elections of 2007. In comparison, in 1990 Togo received 212 million USD or 57 USD per capita. In the last few years, sources of ODA have been few: for the period 2005-2007, 81% of ODA disbursements were made by only six donors: France, European Union, Germany, Arab Fund , UNDP and the Global Fund for HIV / AIDS, Malaria and Tuberculosis.

35. The International Monetary Fund and World Bank are also active in Togo once again. The IMF has provided since 2008, a Poverty Reduction and Growth Facility (PRGF) of SDRs 84.4 million over three years, while the World Bank is preparing to support access Togolese education sector through a Resources Initiative Accelerated Implementation (*Fast Track*) for \$40 million.

36. The self-assessment workshop highlighted several key findings. First, despite the proliferation of planning tools, or perhaps because of this, there is no strategic vision to guide future development. National players have called for the formulation of this vision including a perspective study over the period of the next generation.

37. The workshop participants also noted the difficulty faced by stakeholders in communication, information sharing and mutual awareness for each other’s roles. As an illustration, the institutional framework for implementation of the PRSP does not work as originally planned because the structures which should take part do not acknowledge their institutional responsibilities. Collaboration with the Administration is even more difficult for external stakeholders. Civil society groups are more or less ostracized. The administrative culture tends to regard civil society groups as politically-motivated.

38. The general lack of strategic direction prevailing in various institutions in Togo have been linked to the long period of crisis experienced by the country. This has resulted, *inter alia*, to the supremacy of politics over economics. The political arena is where players seek solutions to the crisis. Institutions - and people who work in them - have forgotten all that was technical, economic, strategic, instead witnessing collapse, or opting for out-migration.

39. UNDP assistance has been described as a long term ally. The UN agency remained in the country during the period of suspension of cooperation with most other donors. It has supported the authorities in the approach to these partners for their return, through a 'road map' for re-engagement, and support for the preparation and organization of the Round Table Conference in Brussels. UNDP assistance has taken the form of strategic programs, two of which bear directly on strategy development: the Capacity Building Programme and the Programme of Support to Public Administration Reform. While workshop participants hailed UNDP's major and decisive contribution in development of strategic capabilities of the country, participants hope that such cooperation will increasingly be driven by a spirit of greater accountability to national authorities. They understand that the lack of capacity has held back national structures, but also draw attention to the risks of 'replacement' or substitution for national execution of programmes. National capacity in this area is being reassessed and is seen as a proposed solution for international agencies in future.

4. UNDP contribution to the development of strategic capabilities

UNDP's Contribution

40. The UNDP contribution to capacity building assistance has been long term. UNDP is one of the few bodies remaining in the country during the period of suspension of cooperation (1993-2005). What is particularly significant - and has been consistently highlighted by national stakeholders in interviews and the self-evaluation workshop - is that UNDP has in this difficult period for the country, helped national authorities formulate a strategy for re-engaging funding partners. This resulted in a paper UNDP co-produced with the World Bank in 2004, which clearly identifies the milestones to full re-engagement with international cooperation. "The Re-Engagement Framework (CRN) is for the Bank and the UNDP, a joint strategy and a framework for strengthening donor assistance over the next two years." (Re-Engagement Framework WB / UNDP / Togo November 2004, p.1).

41. Three priorities are identified in this framework to put the country in a position to reconnect with the donors: "(i) *Strengthen socio-political dynamics of change*, (ii) *Prepare for economic recovery and renewal of links with the international community*, (iii) *Programme for emergency support to social sectors*." Of these three priorities, the second had a direct bearing on the strategic capacity of the country. Fundamental problems of economic management - indispensable for the resumption of external financial assistance - were to be tackled through:

- i. Strengthening poverty diagnosis, information systems and statistical capacity;
- ii. Support for PRSP / MDGs
- iii. Strengthening institutional capacity in key ministries
- iv. Analysis of debt sustainability and review of arrears
- v. Advice on the implementation of a program funded by the IMF and the HIPC
- vi. Implementation of audit processes and building up of fiduciary confidence.

42. UNDP also played a key role in helping countries to prepare and participate in the conference held in Brussels in September 2008 with key technical financial partners: European Union (EU), World Bank, IMF (IMF), Islamic Development Bank (IDB), United

Nations Development Programme (UNDP), Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS) and Economic and Monetary Union of West Africa (EMUWA).

43. This assistance, to UNDP's credit, is important because it significantly impacted the country's strategic capabilities. The decline of international cooperation had catastrophic effects on national capacities. Its gradual restoration is demonstration of strategic decisions to re-engage, encouraging other partners to follow. UNDP has greatly helped Togo in this regard, national authorities have clearly stated that without this support the country might not be where it is today in terms of development cooperation and strategies.

44. UNDP action also takes the form of programs directly enhancing the development of strategic capabilities of the country. These include: (i) Programme of Capacity Building, (ii) Public Administration Reform (iii) Capacity Building Program of Parliament. The first directly targets strategic capacities at the central government level. The two others contribute by creating conditions for effective capacity development. Administrative reform is a critical issue in Togo. The modernization and streamlining of the state administration are prerequisites to the success of capacity development programs. The capacity of Parliament also contributes to national strategic capabilities by giving members the means to exercise better their control over the policies and development strategies.

45. The capacity building program has been implemented since 2004, current programming covers the period 2007-2010. It contributes to:

- i. Support for the PRSP / MDGs
- ii. Supporting statistical services
- iii. Enhancing the effectiveness of aid and citizen accountability
- iv. Support for economic and financial reforms
- v. Consideration of gender in development strategies

46. Since 2006, the program has helped the country develop a national strategy for developing long-term focus on the MDGs (“Beyond the Millennium Development Goals”). The PRSP has crystallized multifaceted support on (i) formulation (preliminary studies, roadmap, specific contributions such as civil society and private sector consultation and validation), (ii) implementation (preparation and updating of the Priority Action Plan, development of a Framework and Medium Term Expenditure Framework, procurement of goods and disbursement, etc..) and monitoring (reporting annual progress).

47 UNDP assistance has helped put the MDGs at the heart of development policies. UNDP will also assist the state in monitoring and production of an annual report of progress on the MDGs . UNDP assistance will also help develop a National Report on Human Development, which this year has been placed under the responsibility of multi-national committee.

48. Statistics services support is being built to produce the data needed to devise policies and development strategies and to monitor their implementation. In this context, UNDP has since 2006 supported the creation of a CWIQ survey. In 2007, the National Strategy for Statistical Development was developed. UNDP is also assisting in the preparation of Togo's 4th General Census of Population and Housing which should take place in 2010. UNDP's

assistance also focuses on the implementation of DevInfo (called TogoInfo). UNDP works in the field of development of statistical capacity in collaboration with other partners such as UNICEF, UNFPA, World Bank and African Development Bank.

49. UNDP has supported advocacy around the principles of the Paris Declaration and with the conduct of the OECD Survey on the subject in 2008. It is also working with countries to establish a platform for managing aid. Its support has also allowed civil society to develop in 2008 a report on the effectiveness of aid. In the same vein of citizen oversight, in addition to the support to civil society in formulating its contribution to the PRSP, the UNDP assists NGOs in their networking efforts to strengthen their capacity to play their oversight role on government policies and actions.

50. UNDP also supports the preparation, implementation and monitoring of economic and financial reforms. It assists the Permanent Secretariat established for this purpose in the Ministry of Economy and Finance (through restructuring, training, equipment, provision of experts, in particular).

51. The inclusion of gender issues in national policies and development strategies was the subject of a separate project, before its integration in 2010 into the Capacity Building Program. UNDP supported the formulation of a policy on Equality and Gender Equity. Training was also conducted on the subject with key national stakeholders such as parliamentarians and other leaders.

52. The Public Administration Reform programme is a result of the findings of a mission diagnosis mission which proposed a "National Strategic Framework for Reform and Modernization of Togolese government." This started in 2009, the program has already:

- i. Provided an international expert within the General Secretariat of Government, to guide and oversee reform and modernization
- ii. Mobilized a national expert on high-level support for 'E-Administration'
- iii. Supported thematic studies on aspects of the reform
- iv. Supported preparation of draft laws, including the reform of the legal framework (there is a new draft General Regulations, and a proposal for reform of social security and pensions)

53. The programme's impacts are seen in the activation of the government's team. Coordination in Prime Minister's office and the presidency is beginning to happen. Meetings are held at ministerial level in a collegial atmosphere. Seminars are also held within government and contribute to harmonize better the efforts of various departments. Engagement letters (Terms of Reference), occasionally used in 2006 have now become standard practice.

54. A third program focuses on capacity building of Parliament. It was built on the basis of the "Strategy for capacity building of the National Assembly of Togo" developed in late 2008 with support from UNDP and the Inter-Parliamentary Union. Under the Programme, with contributions from partners like the EU, UNDP has established a Technical Support Unit with the Finance Committee of the National Assembly. This reviews budgets and may soon expand its activities to the development of technical notes on economic and financial

topics. The goal is to help members better understand the major issues of development of the country to play their oversight role in relation to government policies.

55. In budgetary terms, the resources devoted by UNDP to the development goal of "economic management capacity of the state, private sector and civil society" that supports the programs was raised to \$4.8 million over the 2008-2012 programming cycle. This is composed of \$3.4 million internal resources and \$1.4 million mobilized through other mechanisms. In the absence of a Project Document, budget allocation is done through annual work plans.

Capacity Development Programmes (Units: \$US)

	2007	2008	2009	2010
Capacity Building	863, 663 (90.7% expended)	807,789 (93.5% expended)	992,000 (98.7% expended)	
Public Administration Reform		260,000	1,500,000	2,234,500
Strengthening of Parliament				250,000

Sources: UNDP / Annual Work Plans programs, 2007-2009.

Support to the development of strategic capabilities in UNDP programming tools

56. UNDAF 2008-2012 is structured around three areas of action: (i) improve the incomes of the poor, especially in rural and peri-urban areas, taking into account gender, (ii) improved and more equitable access to basic social services, especially for vulnerable groups, (iii) improving democratic governance (administrative and economic) at all levels. The UNDP Country Programme is part of pillars (i) and (ii) of the UNDAF and of the following objectives: (i) Contribute to the fight against poverty in the MDGs, (ii) Improve governance and strengthen mechanisms for conflict prevention and crisis management.

57. The Country Programme Document clearly states that "the long socio-political crisis and the reduction of technical cooperation programs have led to degradation of national capacities at all levels. The cooperation program of UNDP will be focused on capacity development and implementation of public policies to the poor ... "(§ 7). The idea of helping the country to fill an important gap in strategic capacity is therefore present in the key planning document.

58. This formulation limits the development of capacities to the fight against poverty. But the governance pillar also encompasses "the design and implementation of public policies" (§ 12), and serves as an anchor for a more strategic approach to capacity development. Farther (§ 14) "UNDP will contribute to the preparation of the Reform of Public Administration. This encompassed functions such as preparation and implementation of programs / projects development, reorganization of the statistical system and the establishment of a framework for dialogue between the public and the private sector."

59. The Component of the UNDAF on ‘Capacity for Economic Management’ Outcome 4 on " *democratic governance, administrative and economic* " is framed in the form of outputs, together with their indicators. Expected outputs are: (i) *the legal and institutional framework that would promote good economic governance is enhanced*, (ii) *the program of modernization of public administration is prepared and its implementation begun*, (iii) *a system of integrated management of information, including statistical data, is gradually introduced*, (iv) *the framework of consultation Public Sector-Private sector is strengthened*, and (v) *national capacities to formulate and implement programs and projects are created and / or enhanced*. The corresponding indicators are: " *Plan of Action to strengthen economic governance available; Strategic Framework for Reform of public administration available; National Strategy for Statistical Development Available; Concerted public / private sector operations, Number trained* "

Alignment with the main principles of capacity development

60. UNDP assistance in the field of strategic capacities is ***consistent with the needs*** of Togo in this field. It is part of the first pillar of the PRSP which focuses on the improvement of governance in Togo. To promote ownership, the national authorities were invited to collaborate in the formulation of UNDP programming frameworks (UNDAF and CPD in particular) and in the development of annual work plans. UNDP also combined various methods of intervention to promote development of strategic capabilities in the long term: (i) training (ii) support to institutional reforms (iii) establishment of material and logistical means (iv) mobilization of experts.

61. UNDP has attempted to ***build on local potential***. In mobilizing technical expertise to support projects, it has sought local resource persons when their profiles were consistent with relevant job descriptions. Even when international experts are used, it also arranged for national counterparts to work with them and thus facilitate the internalization of capacity. For example, the international expert supporting reform of public administration works with an adviser to the Prime Minister in the General Secretariat of Government, and with a national counterpart in the Ministry of Public Administration.

62. Financial implementation of projects, however, remains heavily ***dominated by Direct Execution***. This implementation pattern is based on a diagnosis made some years ago which concluded that there were weaknesses of budget execution capacity in most government agencies. Over the period 2004-2007, the implementation rate of investment spending has averaged 40%, according to the “Short and Medium Term Strategy to Improve the Absorptive Capacity of Public Resources” consultancy report (Ministry Cooperation and Development). The situation is improving, and merits adjustment of implementing rules by UNDP, towards national execution. The Director of Budget confirmed that the level of budget execution reached 61% during 2009.

63. A matrix of indicators is presented in UNDP programming tools (as above). The indicators for the outputs are products and activities, and as such ***do not adequately measure*** the acquisition of capacity to formulate and implement development strategies. For example, the number of trained people is a performance indicator that leaves open the question of abilities to run programs and the ability of trainees to put into practice what they learned, in their own working environments.

5. Capacities of UNDP to meet the needs: its strategic capabilities

64. The response of the UNDP country office are consistent with the requirements of the country and its needs for development capabilities. Togo has experienced since 1992 an episode of suspension of cooperation with most of its development partners. There was a pressing need to emerge from this situation by creating the conditions for re-engagement with the international community. UNDP remained in the country, and collaborated with the authorities in attaining minimum requirements for re-engagement. It developed, with the World Bank, a framework for re-engagement, and a way forward for the resumption of cooperation.

65. UNDP also supported the country in the formulation of two versions of the PRSP: an interim PRSP in 2008 and the full PRSP adopted in June 2009 by the Government. This document covers the period 2009-2011 was a prerequisite for the programs of the IMF and World Bank. Its implementation has allowed the country to enter the HIPC Initiative and to benefit from various debt relief mechanisms. It has since 2008 had its first Poverty Reduction Growth Facility (US\$ 84.4 million over three years).

66. UNDP's efforts alongside other donors like the EU to reform and modernize public administration are also an appropriate response to a critical need. After fifteen years of withdrawal, the country's resources had diminished to such an extent that public investments had ceased in many areas. This resulted in a decline of human resources amounting to a haemorrhage of early retirements and 'brain drain' overseas encouraged by the socio-political crisis. The Togolese government thus needed a recovery strategy in order to support development programs in the various sectors of the economy and society.

67. As part of the public administration reforms, the age of retirement has been postponed to 60 years longer to attempt to retain qualified personnel. Officials who remain are also invited on short-term missions that give them the opportunity to mentor younger recruits. UNDP promotes mobilization and return of the Togolese diaspora. Finally, UNDP is seeking to address the digital divide with a digitization project known as "E-Management." A high-level Togolese expert has been recruited and is responsible for this initiative within the Secretariat General of Government.

68. The Office's staff is 41 strong: distributed between various units and programs. The Unit for Economic and Political Strategies, which manages the Capacity Building Program, is composed of: (i) an economic adviser, (ii) a national economist and (iii) an administrative assistant. The Governance Unit, which implements the Public Administration Reform and Strengthening of Parliament, is composed of: (i) Assistant Resident Representative Programme Officer and (ii) an Programme Associate. A post of Programme Officer and one administrative assistant are vacant.

69. The development of strategic capacities is an important dimension in all the interventions of the UNDP office in Togo. However, the matrix of indicators for measuring progress does not encompass adequately the intended impact. In fact, they are indicators merely of the delivery of products. The delivery of products does not guarantee the expected impacts. In addition to indicators of delivery, it would be useful to define indicators of value added, skills

acquired, and the extent they have been applied to forging change. These performance elements are certainly more subtle and more difficult to assess, but deserve to be included in a matrix of results to determine the real value-added programs in the field of strategic capacities.

6. Conclusions and Lessons Learned

70. The inventory of strategic capacities highlighted major deficits. The late finalisation of the PRSP whose origins go back to 2001 is an illustration of this situation. It took the commitment of donors to re-start the formulation process, and lead to two successive products.

71. There are also limits to the integration of existing planning tools. The PRSP is accompanied by a Priority Action Plan for three years while (still in the 'old arsenal') a Three Year Rolling Public Investment Program is prepared. While some senior officials in the Ministries of Finance and Development opine that the PIP should be gradually absorbed by the PAP of the PRSP, others in the same environment believe that both tools are needed, being different in nature. In the latter context, the PAP is constrained by macroeconomic and fiscal policy, which also delimits the PRSP, while the state would have sovereignty over the PIP to consider the ambitious range of investments required to meet development needs. The planning frameworks lack long-term vision that could lengthen perspectives to the horizon of a generation. According to information from the workshop, UNDP has indicated its willingness to support the preparation of such a vision.

72. The state of decay of the Public Service provides another illustration of capacity deficit, both within organizations themselves or individuals. At the institutional level, lack of resources over a long period has led many structures into a sort of vegetative state as they exist in name only and can no longer perform their regulatory functions. Thus, for example, interviews and the national self-assessment workshop highlighted a structure such as the National Centre for Data Processing and Research (Cenet) of the Ministry of Development, formerly at the forefront of programs to computerize government and state companies, is today in such a state of lethargy that officials are considering whether it should be closed.

73. At the individual level, most qualified staff have tended to leave public service. Until the reform of the retirement age, they retired at 55. Budget constraints did not allow recruitment of replacements. Some well qualified individuals still try their luck outside the country, faced with the risks associated with the sociopolitical situation in the country. As a result, there are not enough qualified personnel remaining, only the poorly motivated.

74. A third indication of deficits is in the weakness of budget execution. Over the period 2004-2007, for example, the study on absorptive capacity shows that the implementation rate has averaged 40%. This poor performance is not due to budget deficits, at least not exclusively. It is also explained by real limits to absorptive capacity. A unit responsible for procurement has been relocated to the Ministry of Economy and Finance in order to speed up the function.

75. UNDP has adopted a strategic leadership role. UNDP stayed during the period of suspension of cooperation from most donors. Vis-a-government, it has regularly played a

decisive role as a supporter in the restoration of minimum conditions for the re-engagement of international cooperation.

76. UNDP also supported the preparation, formulation, implementation and monitoring of the PRSP which enabled the country to return to lending with the Bretton Woods Institutions and benefit progressively from the Heavily Indebted Poor Countries Initiative. Togo reached the completion point and now works towards achieving the point of decision. Some debt has been cancelled; the country benefited in 2008 from the IMF's Poverty Reduction and Growth Facility whose disbursements are based on triggers related to implementation of the PRSP.

77. UNDP work on the development of strategic capabilities of Togo continues in the programs listed in its 2008-2012 country program, consistent with the UNDAF 2008-2012 and the PRSP. The two major programs running in this framework are the capacity building program, and the Public Administration Reform program. The first supports economic and financial administrative, planning, implementation and monitoring capacities in the context of national development strategies. It also supports stakeholders like the private sector and civil society to play their roles and complement the role of government. The second works on a large scale and long term, for the restoration and re-capacitation of the state administration. A third project, more limited in scope, targets the National Assembly, to create the conditions for parliamentary oversight.

78. Good practices exist in the implementation of UNDP assistance in Togo, especially in connection with the principles of capacity development, and the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness. UNDP is keen to promote ownership by involving the national party when formulating management interventions, be they strategic programming exercises (UNDAF, CPD, CPAP) or annual work plans. In the mobilization of experts UNDP uses nationals whenever possible, recruited locally or from the diaspora. It also uses international expertise, especially in public administration reform. Management units of projects, and their experts, are located within national structures they are intended to support.

79. Despite these efforts, ownership is still hampered by the fact that program activities are implemented, essentially, by the modality of Direct Execution. This choice is based on an assessment of financial capacity to implement which highlighted critical weaknesses. The situation may merit review, which could lead to more use of national execution modalities. The UNDP country office has indicated that a solution across all members of the UN system was being sought, and another capacity assessment was needed.

80. Interviews with the national stakeholders indicated that the procedures of other development partners put more responsibility on the national partners. The European Union gives budget support and is currently changing modalities for targeting resources for projects (in the transport sector) towards budget support. The Budget Office indicated that the implementation rate of the investment budget was over 61% in 2009, which is a real breakthrough compared to the ratio of 40% prevailing on 2004-2007.

81. The main lesson to be learned from the review of the relationship between UNDP and Togo is that UNDP, without being a major donor with significant financial resources, may play a major role in the future development of a country. Without the support of UNDP in the

strategic period of suspension of cooperation, and subsequent support to the electoral process, Togo would certainly have needed more time to re-engage with the international community. UNDP support to the PRSP has also enabled the country to return gradually to enjoy of the privileges of the HIPC Initiative. At all these levels, UNDP has served as a catalyst for cooperation for the country and a point of entry and conduit for other development partners.

APPENDIX – PERSONS CONSULTED

Last Name	First Name	Role	Organisation
Agbeti	Kodjo Akiro B.	Directeur Général	CENETI/IAI Togo
Agbobli	Edo Kodjo Maurille	Consultant/Enseignant	Université de Lomé/FASEG/UL
Ahondo	Komba Déo	Chargé de Mission	SGG
Pouyo	Alexandre	Chargé de Programme	PNUD/Togo
Amadou	Abdel Fatah	Chef Division du Suivi des Réformes	Secrétariat Permanent aux Réformes économiques et financières
Assih	Atissim	Expert	PRMAP/FP
Bambah	Djerkbary M.	Directeur de la Planification du développement	Ministère de la coopération du Développement et de l'Aménagement du Territoire
Bawara	Gilbert	Minister	Ministry of Cooperation, Development and Country Planning
Bedinade	Biréani	Chef de division Etudes	Direction du Budget/MEF
Bogonou-Zannou	N'gnameJeanne	Analyste de programme	PNUD//Togo
BoukpeSSI	Payadowa	Président Commission des Finances/Ancien Minsitre des Finances	Assemblée Nationale
Cador	Olivier	Directeur/Adjoint Délégation/Adjoint	Agence Française de Développement/Togo
Carrara	Guido	Chargé des Opérations	Union Européenne/Togo
Danyaya	Youssouf.	Economiste	Direction Générale du Développement et de l'Aménagement du Territoire
Danyaya	Issifou	Economiste	MPDAT
Dedji	Affo Tehitchi	Chef Service de Suivi Relations avec la BM et la BAD	Secrétariat Permanent aux Réformes économiques et financières
Djadou	Ayawo Zoglo	Adminsitrateur base de données DevInfo/TogoInfo	Direction de la Statistique et de la Comptabilité
Diakhate	Karim	Directeur des Rédactions	La Dépêche Diplomatique Afrique
Djamena	Atama	Directeur Adjoint	Direction de la Planification du développement
Djenda	Aristide	Directeur Exécutif	UONGTO
Egnonto	Koffi Tessio	Enseignant/Chercheur	Université de

Last Name	First Name	Role	Organisation
			Lomé/LARPSAD/ESA
Essobozou	Awade M.	DCARE/DCD/MPDAT	
Fiadjoe	Honoré Tsatsou	Coordonnateur	Programme National de Gestion de l'E-Administration
Gentry	Akoly	Directeur des Echanges et de la coordination	Direction de la Statistique et de la Comptabilité
Gnongbo	Tak Youssif	Secrétaire Général	Ministère de la Fonction Publique et de la Réforme de l'Administration
Homevor	Alexandre Etsri	Macro économiste	UC/DSRP
Kokou	Waniko	Chargé de Mission	Secrétariat Général du Gouvernement/Cabinet/MPR/PDAT
Kokou Raven	Edu	Président Conseil d'Administration	FONGTO
Kponzo	Kwami Dodzi	Directeur Exécutif	FONGTO (Fédération ONG)
Lamboni	Mindi	Directeur Général/Adjoint	Direction Générale du Développement et de l'Aménagement du Territoire
Ndiira	Prof. Pascal-Firmin	Conseiller Spécial du Président de la République chargé de la Planification, de la Coordination et du Suivi-Evaluation	Présidence de la République
Niane	Souleymane Nasser	Expert en Administration Publique et Développement Institutionnel – Conseiller à la Primature	PNUD/Togo
Nika	Piyabalo		DPD/DDIC
Nonon Saah	Hateedena	Directeur Général	Direction Générale du Développement et de l'Aménagement du Territoire
Ouattara	Baly	Conseiller Technique-Coordination de l'Aide	Ministère de la coopération du Développement et de l'Aménagement du Territoire
Quenum	Claire	Coordinatrice	COSSC
Vossah-Mooh	Béatrice Hanou	Chargée du Suivi-Evaluation	UNICEF/Togo
Wansi	Pépé Satchivi	Chargée de Programme	PNUD/Togo
Yamadjako	Selomey	Représentante	PNUD/Togo

Last Name	First Name	Role	Organisation
		Résidente Adjoint	
Yina	Dominique	Assistant du Directeur Exécutif	UONGTO

APPENDIX 2 – DOCUMENTS CONSULTED

Main UN / UNDP Documentation

UN Development Assistance Framework 2008 – 2012

Country Programme Document 2008 -2012

Country Action Plan (PAPP) 2008 -2012

Capacity - Related Assessments

‘Programme National de Renforcement des Capacités’ 2007 – 2010 (Prepared in 2006)

Togo Chapter of a Review of Implementation of the Paris Declaration (2007)

Etat des Lieux sur la Declaration de Paris by Kokou Amouzouri November 2007 (An assessment of the State of Play c.f. the Paris Declaration)

Mission D’appui A La Mise En Place D’un Cadre Strategique National De Reforme Et De Modernisation De L’administration Publique Togolaise by Souleymane Nasser Niane and Jacques Mariel Nzouankeu June 2008

Stratégie Nationale De Développement De La Statistique (2009-2013):

Diagnostic Du Système Statistique National Mars 2008

Poverty Reduction Strategy 2009 - 2011 (Complete) Final Version June 2009

Amélioration de la capacité d’absorption des ressources publiques: Stratégie à court terme et à moyen terme (undated: late 2009?)

Rapport de Suivi des OMD (Monitoring Report by GoT / UN April 2010)

Strategie Nationale De Developpement De La Statistique (SNDS) 2009-2013 (Document Synthese) (Undated)

Other Background Documentation

Presentation Note on the UNDP Portfolio on Governance and Capacity Development (as at October 2008)

Project Document for the Capacity Development Project

Workplans for the Capacity Development Project 2009 and 2010

Workplans for 2008 and 2009 for the Public Administration Reform Project

Other Sources

African Development Bank Country Profile and Country Strategy for Togo

World Bank Country Profile and Country Strategy for Togo

BBC News Website Historical TimeLine for Togo